

Planning Report

Thursday, November 6, 2014

Deer Run PUD, Subarea C - Cortona

Case Summary

Agenda Item	1
Case Number	14-062FDP/FP
Site Location	Deer Run Northeast corner of Dublin Road and Memorial Drive.
Proposal	To plat and develop 37 single-family, cluster lots with 7.3 acres of open space and associated site improvements on 17.66 acres.
Applicant	Romanelli & Hughes Building Co.; represented by Mike Close and Thomas Hart.
Case Manager	Marie Downie, Planner I (614) 410-4679 mdownie@dublin.oh.us
Requests	Review and approval of a <u>final development plan</u> under the provisions of Zoning Code Section 153.050. Review and recommendation of approval to City Council for a <u>final plat</u> under the provisions of the Chapter 152, Subdivision Regulations.
Planning Recommendation	Based on Planning's analysis, this proposal complies with all applicable review criteria and the existing development standards and approval is recommended with the conditions noted below.
Conditions	<u>Final Development Plan</u> <ol style="list-style-type: none">1) Lots 1-8, 11-13, 18-20, 29-37 provide additional architectural details, as outlined in the development text;2) All façades that are visible or oriented towards a private drive on lots 1, 12, 19, 33 and 37 be required to have a minimum of 40% brick or stone as well as additional architectural detailing;3) The houses for lots 19 and 33 be located as close as possible to the front of the build zone.4) Small house models must be used on lots 19 and 33 to provide for adequate outdoor space.5) The tree replacement fee in lieu will be required to be paid in full prior to issuing building permits; and

- 6) The applicant provides screening of the proposed service structures located at the entry along Memorial Drive, subject to approval by Planning.

Final Plat

- 1) The applicant shall ensure that any minor technical adjustments to the plat are made prior to City Council submittal.



City of Dublin

14-062FDP/FP
Final Development Plan/Final Plat
Deer Run - Subarea C
Dublin Road & Memorial Drive

0 150 300
Feet



Facts

Site Area	17.66 acres
Zoning	PUD, Planned Unit Development District (approved as Ordinance 11-11 on March 28, 2011)
Surrounding Zoning and Uses	North: PUD, Planned Unit Development District, Deer Run - Subareas A & B West: PUD, Planned Unit Development District, Muirfield Village South: PUD, Planned Unit Development District, Amberleigh Subdivision East: Amberleigh Community Park
Site Features	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Frontage: Memorial Drive – approximately 1,070 feet; Dublin Road - approximately 450 feet. Vegetation: Heavily wooded with mature trees throughout.
Site History	<p>2014 The Planning and Zoning Commission tabled this Final Development Plan/Final Plat at the request of the applicant on September 18, 2014. The Commission had concerns regarding the quality of the architecture, lot sizes and driveway locations along the entry drive.</p> <p>2011 The Planning and Zoning Commission reviewed the rezoning/preliminary development plan/preliminary plat for the Deer Run subdivision. The Commission supported the decrease in density for Subarea C. The Commission expressed concerns regarding the proposed private drives due to the maintenance and expense required by the homeowners. The Commission stressed the importance of high quality architecture and emphasized the need for four-sided architecture in Subarea C. The Commission did not agree with the Staff recommendation for internal sidewalks. The preliminary development plan/rezoning and preliminary plat was forwarded to City Council with positive recommendations.</p> <p>City Council approved the rezoning/preliminary development plan and plat, including a tree waiver due to the large number of trees planted by the owner. City Council eliminated internal sidewalks. Council expressed concerns regarding the private drives in Subarea C. Council recalled past subareas that were approved for private drives but due to the high maintenance and repair costs the homeowners associations could not provide adequate funds. City Council requested that the development text be revised to require a minimum of 14 lots with side-loaded garages.</p> <p>2009 A concept plan for the Deer Run subdivision was reviewed by the Planning and Zoning Commission in 2009. The Commission supported the proposal moving forward as a formal rezoning/preliminary development plan application.</p>

Details	Final Development Plan
Process	<p>The final development plan conforms with and provides a detailed refinement of the approved preliminary development plan. The final development plan includes all of the final details of the proposed development and is the final stage of the PUD process.</p>
Proposal	<p>The final development plan for Subarea C includes:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 37 single family lots clustered behind reserves along Memorial Drive and Dublin Road to preserve surrounding trees • Example lot configurations and architectural concepts • Tree preservation and replacement details • Entry feature, sign and landscape details • 7.304 acres of open space <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Reserves 'D' and 'E' are located along the perimeter of the site and will serve as Tree Preservation Zones. ○ Reserves 'A' 'B' 'C' 'F' and 'G' are islands in the proposed private drives. ○ All reserves are to be owned and maintained by the homeowners association.
Development Standards	<p>The approved PUD development text includes specific requirements that address the zoning and development details.</p>
Use/Density/Lot Sizes/Setbacks	<p>The development text permits 37 single-family detached cluster lots in Subarea C with a maximum density of 2.2 du/ac. Lots vary in size and are required by the text to be a minimum of 120 feet deep and 60 feet wide as measured at the maximum depth of the front build zone. Two lots fail to meet these minimum measurements and require a minor text modification.</p> <p>Dublin Road and Memorial Drive require a 100-foot building and pavement setback. The text requires minimum setbacks of 30 feet for rear yards, five feet for side yards, 10 feet building separation and a 0-10 foot Required Build Zone along all private drive frontages, which are met with the proposal. Patios, decks and fences are permitted to encroach into the rear yard setback by 10 feet.</p> <p>While the development text permits a 10-foot distance between structures and a five-foot side yard setback, there will be additional Building Code requirements if any portion of the structure, including overhangs, is located less than 5 feet from the property line.</p>
Traffic and Access	<p>Access is provided from Memorial Drive by Sapri Boulevard, a gated private drive aligned with the intersection of Autumnwood Way. All access throughout the site is provided by private drives that shall be owned and maintained by the forced funded homeowners association.</p>

Details	Final Development Plan
Sidewalks	<p>A five-foot sidewalk is proposed along the southern border of the site connecting the existing paths along Dublin Road to Vista Ridge Drive. A four-foot path is proposed between Lots 29 and 30 to connect Pesaro Way to the northern boundary of Amberleigh Community Park. No internal sidewalks are required as approved by City Council.</p>
Parking and Garages	<p>There are 44 on-street parking spaces in designated bump-outs along the private access drives. A minimum 26 foot wide, back-of-curb to back-of-curb private drive is required where on-street parking is permitted.</p> <p>All units are required to have a two-car garage and two additional parking spaces in driveway stacking areas or auto courts. The development text requires a minimum of 14 lots to have side-loaded garages. These are intended to be auto court garages. Planning has clarified that the auto court garages are considered side-loaded garages, which will allow the minimum number of side-loaded garage requirements to be used.</p>
Architecture	<p>The development text design requirements describe the architectural style of the subarea as “Romantic Revival.” The development text outlines requirements for materials, colors, four-sided architecture, and additional architecture on certain lots. When side or rear façades are visible from the street, oriented towards a street or visible from a neighboring lot, the amount of brick and stone used must be proportional to the amount used on the front façade. Based on this requirement, lots 1-8, 11-13, 18-20, 29-37 will require additional architectural detailing.</p> <p>The Planning and Zoning Commission previously expressed concerns regarding the quality of the architecture as part of the initial review. The applicant has revised the architecture examples and included street-view elevations that provide a visual of how the elevations will fit together. In response, the applicant has agreed to provide brick or stone on 40% of all façades on lots 1, 12, 19, 33 and 37 that are visible from a private drive or oriented toward a private drive.</p> <p>Additionally, the applicant has provided updated renderings with improved architectural details that are consistent with the theme shown as part of the preliminary development plan.</p>

Details	Final Development Plan
Tree Preservation	<p>The development text outlines a goal to preserve as many trees in good and fair condition as possible. City Council approved a tree waiver, as the property owner had previously planted a significant number of trees on the site. The approved tree waiver requires the applicant to replace trees that are between six to 18 inches (DBH) on a tree-for-tree basis that are removed from open space and rear yard setbacks and any trees that are above 18 inches (DBH) on an inch-for-inch basis. Trees between six to 18 inches (DBH) that are removed for roadway construction, utility easement improvements or stormwater measures are not required to be replaced.</p> <p>According to the tree survey, many of the existing trees are dead or in poor condition and will be removed. The tree waiver requires 514 inches to be replaced; 240.5 inches are provided. The applicant is proposing to pay a fee in lieu of replacement for the additional 273.5 inches. The fee in lieu will be required to be paid in full prior to issuing building permits.</p> <p>Planning will work with the applicant to provide appropriate screening of the proposed service structures located along Memorial Drive.</p>
Open Space and Landscaping	<p>The proposed plan includes 7.304 acres of open space owned and maintained by a forced funded homeowners association.</p> <p>Reserves 'D' - 'E' are located along the perimeter of the site and serve as Tree Protection Zones to provide a buffer. Reserves 'A' - 'C' and 'F' - 'G', as shown in the Final Development Plan, are located throughout the site as islands in the private drives.</p>
Entry Feature	<p>The development text states that the boulevard access drive is permitted a gate and entry feature sign(s) along Memorial Drive with the total permitted area of the signs at 20 square feet. The plans show five decorative six-foot tall columns with Craftsman Style Light Fixtures consistent with the Dublin Road entrance. Three of the columns are incorporated with the gate. The remaining two columns are located on either sides of Sapri Boulevard, south of the proposed gate along Memorial Drive, which each contain identical 1.8 square foot signs.</p>

Details	Final Development Plan
Utilities and Stormwater Management	<p>Sanitary sewer service will be provided to this site through the construction of new public mains that will connect to the existing 36 inch sewer on the east edge of the site.</p> <p>Public water service is provided via the installation of a private water system included new mains, private hydrants and master metered services. This system will connect into the existing 8-inch water main along the north side of Memorial Drive.</p> <p>This site will be required to meet the Stormwater Code and Ohio EPA regulations. This will be accomplished by installing new storm sewer mains, storm structures, and will provide water quality by means of a hydrodynamic separator and stormwater filter. It should be noted that this sites lies within the Scioto River Corridor Exemption area and is not required to provide for stormwater detention or meet stormwater quantity requirements.</p>

Analysis and Recommendation	Minor Text Modification
Process	<p>Code Section 153.053(E)(2)(b)4b permits the Commission to approve a modification to the development text and Zoning Code if they determine that all of the appropriate provisions are satisfied.</p>
Request	<p>The requested development text modification is to permit lots 19 and 33 to have lot dimensions that are less than required by the development text. The development text currently requires lot depths to be 120 feet and lot widths to be 60 feet, measured at the greatest depth of the Required Build Zone, which is not met with these lots.</p> <p>As part of the initial final development plan review, the Commission requested the applicant revise the four lots to meet the development text. Lots 1 and 37, previously included in the text modification, were originally shown incorrectly, but have been corrected to meet the minimum lot requirements. The applicant has investigated the modification of the remaining two lots to meet the text and determined that doing so would result in alterations that would significantly impact the nature of the development.</p> <p>Planning supports this text modification with the conditions that the houses for lots 19 and 33 be located as far as possible into the 0-10 foot build zones and the house sited on these lots be a small model. The applicant has provided example lot configurations to demonstrate that sufficient space is available for a house, garage and outdoor space. The additional conditions will place the houses closer to the street and allow for ample outdoor space to the side and rear. Based on the criteria, the approval of this minor text modification would not affect surrounding developments, increase the density or influence the quality or community.</p>

Analysis and Recommendation		Minor Text Modification
Recommendation	Planning recommends approval for the minor text modification with the conditions included in the final development plan.	

Analysis	Final Development Plan
Process	Section 153.050 of the Zoning Code identifies criteria for the review and approval for a final development plan (full text of criteria attached). Following is an analysis by Planning based on those criteria.
1) <i>Consistency with the approved preliminary development plan.</i>	<p>Criterion met with conditions and text modifications: This proposal is consistent with the requirements of the proposed preliminary development plan with the following conditions:</p> <p>Lots 1-8, 11-13, 18-20, 29-37 will be required to provide additional architectural details, as outlined in the existing development text.</p> <p>All façades that are visible or oriented towards a private drive on lots 1, 12, 19, 33 and 37 be required to have a minimum of 40% brick or stone as well as additional architectural detailing.</p> <p>The houses for lots 19 and 33 be located as close as possible to the front of the build zones.</p> <p>Small house models must be used on lots 19 and 33 to provide for adequate outdoor space.</p>
2) <i>Traffic and pedestrian safety</i>	Criterion met: The proposal provides safe vehicular and pedestrian circulation.
3) <i>Adequate public services and open space</i>	Criterion met: The proposal meets required open space and public services.
4) <i>Protection of natural features and resources</i>	Criterion met: The site layout for the proposal locates all of the lots within the center of the site in order to protect the mature trees along the perimeter of the site.
5) <i>Adequacy of lighting</i>	Criterion met: Lighting is proposed on the columns located at the entrance of the subarea.
6) <i>Signs consistent with preliminary development plan</i>	Criterion met: The entry feature signs meet the development text.

Analysis		Final Development Plan
7) <i>Appropriate landscaping to enhance, buffer, & soften the building and site</i>	Criterion met with Conditions: Planning recommends additional landscaping be provided to screen the proposed service structures located at the entry subject to Planning approval. The fee in lieu for replacement trees will be required to be paid in full prior to issuing building permits.	
8) <i>Compliant Stormwater management</i>	Criterion met: The proposal meets the requirements of the Code.	
9) <i>All phases comply with the previous criteria.</i>	Not applicable.	
10) <i>Compliance with other laws & regulations.</i>	Criterion met: The proposal appears to comply with all other known applicable local, state, and federal laws and regulations.	

Recommendation		Final Development Plan
Approval	In Planning's analysis, this proposal complies with the proposed development text and the final development plan criteria. Planning recommends approval with six conditions.	
Conditions	1) Lots 1-8, 11-13, 18-20, 29-37 provide additional architectural details, as outlined in the development text; 2) All façades that are visible or oriented towards a private drive on lots 1, 12, 19, 33 and 37 be required to have a minimum of 40% brick or stone as well as additional architectural detailing; 3) The houses for lots 19 and 33 be located as far as possible into the 0-10 foot build zone as possible. 4) Small house models must be used on lots 19 and 33 to provide for adequate outdoor space. 5) The tree replacement fee in lieu will be required to be paid in full prior to issuing building permits; and 6) The applicant provides screening of the proposed service structures located at the entry along Memorial Drive, subject to approval by Planning.	

Details		Final Plat
Process	The purpose of the final plat is to assure conformance with the requirements set forth in Sections 152.085 through 152.095 of the Code, exclusive of other standards in the Code.	
Plat Overview	The proposed preliminary plat subdivides 17.66 acres of land into 37 single-family lots and 7.3 acres of open space.	

Details	Final Plat
Open Space	<p>The development text requires the dedication of 7.3 acres of open space and the proposal contains 7.304 acres of open space. All reserves and entry features are to be owned and maintained by the homeowners association.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Reserves 'E' and 'D' along the perimeter of the site are Tree Preservation Zones. • Reserves 'A' 'B' 'C' 'F' and 'G' are islands in the proposed private drives.
Streets	<p>The proposed plans show easements to allow for private drives as approved by City Council with the rezoning.</p> <p>In response to the Commission's concerns regarding driveway access off Sapri Boulevard, the applicant has modified the landscape islands and has included a note on the plat that requires driveways for lots 1 and 37 to be restricted to Pesaro Way.</p>

Analysis	Final Plat
Process	<p>Following a recommendation by the Commission, the final plat will be forwarded to City Council for final action. The plat can be recorded after City Council approval. After approval the applicant can proceed with the building permit process.</p>
1) Plat Information and Construction Requirements	<p>Criterion met with condition: This proposal is consistent with the requirements of the Zoning Code and Subdivision Regulations and all required information is included on the plat. Any other minor technical adjustments should be made prior to Council review.</p>
2) Street, Sidewalk, and Bikepath Standards	<p>Criterion met: Street widths, grades, curvatures, and signs comply with the appropriate Code sections. The lack of sidewalks throughout the subarea was approved by City Council.</p>
3) Utilities	<p>Criterion met: This plat establishes necessary easements for the construction and maintenance of utilities in accordance with all applicable standards.</p>
4) Open Space Requirements	<p>Criterion met: Open space dedication, ownership, and maintenance are all indicated and noted on the plat. All open space will be owned and maintained by the homeowners association.</p>

Recommendation		Final Plat
Summary	This proposal complies with the final plat review criteria and approval of this request is recommended with one condition.	
Condition	1) That the applicant ensures that any minor technical adjustments to the plat are made prior to City Council submittal.	

MINOR TEXT MODIFICATION

Section 153.053(E)(2)(b)4,b)

4. Compliance with the preliminary development plan. In reviewing the application, the Planning and Zoning Commission shall determine if the final development plan substantially complies with all specific requirements, the purposes, intent and basic objectives of the preliminary development plan, and any commitments made or conditions agreed to with the adoption of the preliminary development plan and if it represents an expansion and delineation of the approved preliminary development plan.
 - a. Planning and Zoning Commission may determine that the proposed plan complies with the preliminary development plan and may proceed to review the Final Development Plan in accordance with the procedures of this section.
 - b. The Planning and Zoning Commission may, in reviewing the final development plan, approve a modification of a provision of the development standards text if they determine that all of the following provisions are satisfied:
 - (i) The Planning and Zoning Commission determines that, for this PD, the code compliance is not needed in order to ensure that the PD is consistent with the Community Plan and compatible with existing, approved, or planned adjacent development;
 - (ii) Planning and Zoning Commission determines that the proposed modification does not significantly alter the list of permitted or conditional uses, cause an inappropriate increase in density or cause inconsistencies with the Community Plan;
 - (iii) The proposed modification results in a development of equivalent or higher quality than that which could be achieved through strict application of the requirement(s);
 - (iv) The principles of § [153.052](#)(B) are achieved; and
 - (v) The development, as proposed on the final development plan, will have no adverse impact upon the surrounding properties or upon the health, safety or general welfare of the community.
 - c. Any proposed modification to a preliminary development plan that fails to meet the above criteria shall require a zoning amendment to the preliminary development plan according to § [153.234](#).

FINAL DEVELOPMENT PLAN CRITERIA

Review Criteria

In accordance with Section 153.055(B) *Plan Approval Criteria*, the Code sets out the following criteria of approval for a final development plan:

- 1) The plan conforms in all pertinent respects to the approved preliminary development plan provided, however, that the Planning and Zoning Commission may authorize plans as specified in §153.053(E)(4);
- 2) Adequate provision is made for safe and efficient pedestrian and vehicular circulation within the site and to adjacent property;
- 3) The development has adequate public services and open spaces;
- 4) The development preserves and is sensitive to the natural characteristics of the site in a manner that complies with the applicable regulations set forth in this Code;
- 5) The development provides adequate lighting for safe and convenient use of the streets, walkways, driveways, and parking areas without unnecessarily spilling or emitting light onto adjacent properties or the general vicinity;
- 6) The proposed signs, as indicated on the submitted sign plan, will be coordinated within the Planned Unit Development and with adjacent development; are of an appropriate size, scale, and design in relationship with the principal building, site, and surroundings; and are located so as to maintain safe and orderly pedestrian and vehicular circulation;
- 7) The landscape plan will adequately enhance the principal building and site; maintain existing trees to the extent possible; buffer adjacent incompatible uses; break up large expanses of pavement with natural material; and provide appropriate plant materials for the buildings, site, and climate;
- 8) Adequate provision is made for storm drainage within and through the site which complies with the applicable regulations in this Code and any other design criteria established by the City or any other governmental entity which may have jurisdiction over such matters;
- 9) If the project is to be carried out in progressive stages, each stage shall be so planned that the foregoing conditions are complied with at the completion of each stage; and
- 10) The Commission believes the project to be in compliance with all other local, state, and federal laws and regulations.

FINAL PLAT CRITERIA

Review Criteria

The Zoning Code does not contain specific criteria to guide the review of plats. Planning bases the evaluation on the conformance of the plat with the requirements set forth in Chapter 152: *Subdivision Regulations* of the Code, which are summarized below:

- The proposed final plat document includes all the required technical information.
- Construction will be bonded and completed in an appropriate time frame, inspections will be conducted by the City in accordance with Engineering standards for improvements, and maintenance will be completed as necessary.
- The proposed lots, street widths, grades, curvatures, intersections, and signs comply with the standards set forth in these Code sections.
- The proposal includes provisions for water, storm drainage, sanitary sewer, electric, telephone, and cable supplies in accordance with approved standards.
- The proposed development complies with the open space and recreation facility requirements or payment into the Parkland Acquisition Fund is made in lieu of dedication.

In addition, the Planning and Zoning Commission is to determine that the final layout and details of the final plat comply with the approved preliminary plat. The Commission is to consider several factors in making its recommendation:

- 1) The final plat conforms with the approved preliminary plat;
- 2) The plat conforms to the adopted Thoroughfare Plan and meets all applicable parkland dedication and open space requirements; and
- 3) The final plat conforms to the subdivision and zoning regulations, municipal stormwater regulations, and other applicable requirements.